



NEW ZEALAND INSTITUTE FOR THE STUDY  
OF COMPETITION AND REGULATION INC.

Report Prepared for the New Zealand  
Ministry of Agriculture and Forestry

**The Role and Significance of Cooperatives in  
New Zealand Agriculture: A Comparative  
Institutional Analysis**

Lewis Evans

and

Richard Meade

December 2005

# Contents

Page

<b>1. Introduction and Summary</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1 Purpose of the Report	1
1.2 Agricultural Sub-Sectors Considered	1
1.3 Cooperative Definition	1
1.4 Analytical Framework	2
1.5 Public Policy Questions	3
1.5.1 Two Main Heads	3
1.5.2 Particular Policy Question Dimensions	4
1.6 Structure of the Report	4
1.7 Main Findings	5
<b>2. Cooperatives Defined</b>	<b>8</b>
2.1 Cooperative Principles	8
2.1.1 Cooperative Origins	8
2.1.2 Rochdale Principles	8
2.1.3 ICA Principles	9
2.1.4 US Principles	9
2.1.5 Principles Contrasted with Investor Ownership	9
2.2 Functional Definitions	10
2.3 Comparative Legal Definitions	11
2.3.1 New Zealand	11
2.3.2 Other Jurisdictions	16
2.4 Features and Criticisms of Traditional Cooperatives	18
2.4.1 Features	18
2.4.2 Criticisms	21
2.5 The New Generation Cooperative (NGC)	23
2.6 A Cooperative Typology	25
2.7 Cooperatives in New Zealand Agriculture	27
2.8 Policy Implications	28
<b>3. Factors Affecting Cooperative Evolution</b>	<b>30</b>
3.1 An Institutional Framework	30
3.1.1 Institutions and Institutional Change	30
3.1.2 The Economics of Vertical Integration	32
3.1.3 The Economics of Ownership	33
3.2 Arguments for Cooperative Formation	34
3.2.1 Survey of Theoretical Cooperative Strategies	34
3.2.2 Applying the Economics of Ownership	36

3.3	Model of Cooperative Evolution.....	42
3.4	Contemporary Drivers of Cooperative Evolution.....	44
3.4.1	Trade Liberalisation and Increasing Competition.....	44
3.4.2	Changing Consumer Preferences.....	45
3.4.3	Producer Board Dismantling and Organisational Competition.....	46
3.4.4	Cooperative Adaptations.....	47
3.5	Policy Implications.....	48
<b>4.</b>	<b>Theoretical and Empirical Literature on Cooperatives.....</b>	<b>51</b>
4.1	Efficiency and Financial Performance.....	52
4.1.1	Studies based on Financial Ratios.....	53
4.1.2	Studies based on Economic Efficiency and Other Measures.....	56
4.1.3	Summary – Efficiency and Financial Performance.....	58
4.2	Competition and Competitiveness.....	60
4.2.1	Competitive Effects of Cooperatives in Mixed Industry Structures.....	60
4.2.2	Implications of Mixed Industry Structures for Procurement.....	64
4.2.3	International Competitiveness of Cooperatives.....	66
4.2.4	Summary – Competition and Competitiveness.....	70
4.3	Product Differentiation, Value-Added and Innovation.....	71
4.3.1	Product Differentiation.....	71
4.3.2	Value-Added and Quality Choice.....	73
4.3.3	Innovation.....	75
4.3.4	Summary – Product Differentiation, Value-Added and Innovation.....	76
4.4	Governance.....	77
4.4.1	Agency Cost Problems.....	77
4.4.2	Impact of Member Heterogeneity.....	79
4.4.3	Information, Adversity and Trust.....	81
4.4.4	Summary – Governance.....	83
4.5	Access to Capital, Investment, and Growth.....	85
4.5.1	Access to Capital.....	85
4.5.2	Investment.....	87
4.5.3	Growth, and Failure Risk.....	88
4.5.4	Summary – Access to Capital, Investment, and Growth.....	89
4.6	Cooperative Evolution.....	91
4.6.1	Nature and Incidence of Cooperative Reorganisations.....	91
4.6.2	Results of Cooperative Reorganisations.....	95
4.6.3	Drivers and Success Factors.....	96
4.6.4	Obstacles to Cooperative Evolution.....	96
4.6.5	Summary – Cooperative Evolution.....	97
4.7	Policy Implications.....	99

<b>5. Cooperatives in New Zealand Agriculture</b>	<b>101</b>
5.1 Background on New Zealand Agricultural Organisation	102
5.1.1 Cooperatives in the Late Nineteenth and Early Twentieth Centuries	102
5.1.2 The Development of Statutory Producer Boards	102
5.1.3 Transition to New Industry Structures	104
5.2 Dairy	104
5.2.1 Milk Processing	104
5.2.2 Downstream Processing	105
5.2.3 Other Industry Activities	106
5.2.4 Discussion	106
5.3 Beef, Lamb and Venison	107
5.4 Wool	110
5.5 Fishing and Aquaculture	112
5.6 Horticulture	115
5.6.1 Kiwifruit	115
5.6.2 Apples	116
5.7 Forestry	118
5.8 Rural Supplies	120
5.9 Fertiliser Production/Importation	121
5.10 Comparison with Other Sectors	122
5.10.1 Agricultural Cooperatives Overseas	122
5.10.2 Cooperatives in New Zealand Non-Agricultural Sectors	124
5.11 Summary	125
5.12 Policy Implications	127
<b>6. Areas for Further Research</b>	<b>128</b>
<b>7. Conclusions</b>	<b>130</b>
<b>References</b>	<b>133</b>

## Abbreviations

AFL	Aotearoa Fisheries Limited
ASX	Australian Stock Exchange
BSE	Bovine spongiform encephalopathy, or “mad cow disease”
CAP	EU common agricultural policy
EU	European Union
FCB	Farmer-controlled business
FMA	Fisheries management area
FOB	Farmer-owned brand
GATT	General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade
GE	Genetic engineering
HEA	Horticulture Export Authority
ICA	International Co-operative Alliance
IFRS	International financial reporting standards
IOF	Investor-owned firm
IPS	Industrial and provident society
ISCR	New Zealand Institute for the Study of Competition and Regulation
ITQ	Individual transferable quota
MAF	New Zealand Ministry of Agriculture and Forestry
NGC	New-generation cooperative
NZAX	New Zealand Alternative Exchange, run by NZX
NZSX	New Zealand Stock Exchange, main listed share board run by NZX
NZCA	New Zealand Co-operatives Association
NZDB	New Zealand Dairy Board
NZX	New Zealand Exchange
PMO	Producer marketing organisation
TIMOS	Timber management organisations
TNC	Trans-national corporation
USDA	United States Department of Agriculture

Exchange rates as at 30 September 2005:

1 NZD = 0.91 AUD = 0.57 EUR = 0.39 STG = 0.70 USD = 77 YEN

## Acknowledgements

The authors gratefully acknowledge the support and assistance of MAF staff members in researching and preparing this report. Particular thanks go to Gillian Mangin and colleagues for assisting with the identification of cooperative players across New Zealand's various agricultural sub-sectors. Ali Harley and Marion Riddell of the MAF library, and Lynne Biggs, have provided invaluable assistance in identifying and locating source materials, sometimes obscure.

The authors wish to specially thank Ian Reid of the New Zealand Co-operatives Association (NZCA) for generously sharing with them his time and resources. Mick Calder and Phillip Porter also provided useful backgrounds on aspects of the structure of New Zealand's meat and wool industries.

Helpful comments on a draft of the report were received from Gillian Mangin, Dan Bolger and Garry Herrington of MAF, Ian Reid of NZCA, Eric Hansen of Fonterra, and Professor Gert van Dijk, Director General of the Dutch National Cooperative Council for agriculture and horticulture (NCR). Last but not least, the authors thank Yinjia (Andrea) Lu and Rathy Manickaratnam for their invaluable research assistance. Any errors or omissions remain the responsibility of the authors.

## Author Contacts

*Lewis Evans*      New Zealand Institute for the Study of Competition and Regulation  
Victoria University of Wellington  
*Email:* lew.evans@vuw.ac.nz

*Richard Meade*      New Zealand Institute for the Study of Competition and Regulation  
Victoria University of Wellington

Cognitus Advisory Services Limited  
*Email:* richard.meade@cognitus.co.nz

## Important Notice

In preparing this report the authors have relied upon public information, and information provided by MAF, New Zealand Co-operatives Association, and others. No warranty or indemnity, express or implied, is given by the authors or their related institutions, to any party, as to the accuracy or completeness of this report, and no liability is accepted by the authors or their related institutions for any losses or damages incurred by any party relying on this report. The views expressed in this report should not be taken to represent those of the institutions to which the authors belong.